Dear Dr. x,

I have reviewed the comments on the Southeastern draft. My paper was about comparing Beowulf to Katniss from The Hunger Games series. There are a few suggestions brought up that I am confused about.

First, I agree that I did not have a specific thesis that was spot on for the essay; but "though there are many traits of a hero that Beowulf and Katniss, the three traits of courage, pride, and leadership are the three main points of the two characters" was not my thesis. It was only the concluding sentence to my comparison paragraph.

I set up my essay in the following format:
1. Introduction
2. Comparison paragraph (only heroic traits)
3. Contrasting paragraph (different heroic traits)
4. Beowulf's cons (that are atypical to a hero)
5. Katniss' cons (that are atypical to a hero)
6. A conclusion

Now, the essay's prompt was to compare and contrast Beowulf to a modern day hero; so all I felt needed to be brought up were the character's heroic traits. My character was from a novel, so my main sources were the books. Whenever I brought up examples from the series, you commented and told me to explain more. I feel like if I were to go into more detail about the event, it would drag me away from the prompt and weaken my essay. I brought up a trait (leadership, pride, courage, etc.), gave an example and briefly explained it (Katniss saving her friend Gale, wearing the Mockingjay pin, Beowulf's battles, etc.), told how the example is pertinent to the trait (protected the Danes, using wit to destroy the Careers' supplies, etc.), and then cited the page numbers or location to find the examples. If I went into detail about explaining who Unferth was and why he called out Beowulf or who Madge was in the series, that would lose focus of the topic; and there are citations for both of these characters in their respective novels.

For the example I brought up for Katniss' cleverness, I used the scene in the Hunger Games novel where Katniss was in the bushes thinking of a way to destroy the Careers' supplies. At the very end of my quote and briefly explaining the scene, I gave a citation about where it can be found. I did not need to explain who Foxface or the Careers are or why there were landmines around the supplies. It was an example I brought up and BRIEFLY explained to make my point about Katniss creating preconceived plans. If I explained all the characters and set up to that point of the scene, I would lose focus of the prompt.

Another concern I have is only having to explain The Hunger Games series. The only time I was asked to explain a scene was from Collin's series; but when I explained Beowulf, there were probably one or two scenes where I had to explain (again, which were both cited and would lose focus if they were explained). I wrote it in a way that the reader did not read Beowulf or The Hunger Games series, so I brieﬂy explained scenes that I used as an example. They are both major novels that have been read by a majority today and have been discussed in many places, so I would expect the reader to at least understand the plots from hearing it around. If the reader/professor has only read one novel, I do not find it fair how that person would request to have the latter of the two they are not familiar with explained -- but I did not write the paper expecting the reader to know both the novels cover-to-cover, but did not want to go into full detail about the stories.

Another tiny issues was in the conclusion. I said that Katniss models a modern hero for self composure and intelligence, but both the tutor and you wanted me to include the fact that she was a female leader. From the time I started brainstorming, I did not want to use that as an example. If I were to do that, I would have to bring up something similar to a "if a guy can do it, a
I'm sorry to hear you disagree about gender equality. I agree that everyone is equal. I did not intend to criticize your essay. I just wanted to clarify my position.

Thank you,

Y

Y,

I'm happy to explain. The problem with your essay was the lack of a clear thesis statement. Without a thesis, it's hard to understand your points. I think you have a good grasp of the topics, but you need to focus on organizing your thoughts. I especially liked your analysis of the two books.

I've added comments to your essay to help you improve your writing. Please review the rubric in your handbook and the grading sheet posted on your MCL home page.

After careful consideration, I've changed your grade to a 90. I seldom make exceptions, but your email was well-written and I was impressed by your effort.

Thanks,

Dr. X